

Seeley's book. These range from Charles Gounod through to Walter Sickert and to Lord Alfred Douglas (an intimate of Carte's elder son Michael, who followed him from Winchester to Magdalen College, Oxford). Interconnected with many individuals who continue to interest us today, Carte was as an exemplar of Victorian ambition and industriousness.

There is an inevitable sense of a loss at what this book might have been, and the reader may feel from time to time that the focus is on the wrong Carte. There is surely much more to be said about Helen, who managed the company, first as Carte's assistant, then as a sort of regent as infirmities beset him during his final years, until she finally (with her own iron will) assumed sovereignty in 1901. She was not just 'the woman behind the man', but very much the woman behind the company. A joint biography—or a treatment of the D'Oyly Carte family bound together in the same enterprise across a century—would be welcome. The first decade of the twentieth century was a critical one for the company under Helen's leadership: Carte was dead, and the company was now living off a diet of established shows, whereas hitherto it had presented a more-or-less steady stream of novelties. Moreover, it had vacated the Savoy Theatre, and even upon returning for two repertory seasons (1906–7 and 1908–9) ostensibly under Gilbert's own direction, the lack of an established home in the Strand was damaging to the morale and reputation of the company, which, while carrying the Carte torch, was no longer a shrine of pilgrimage.

Seeley treats this in his final chapter, 'Legacy and Posterity', and it may be his most important contribution to the Savoy opera bibliography. The chapter is brief—just eleven pages—but could have easily been four or five times that length (although the period covered would go beyond that of the book's series, *Music in Nineteenth-Century Britain*). It is not the first examination of the D'Oyly Carte Opera Company after Carte's death, but it offers a valuable new perspective. Rather than a hagiography that is becoming too familiar, Seeley leaves one with the impression that the 1981 denial of the Arts Council grant application and the subsequent financial failure of the company was inevitable and well-deserved, given the ethos of the company management for the fifty or so years preceding it. The ironic contrast between the hide-bound conservatism of the company and the audacious and forward-thinking entrepreneurship of the man who founded it is striking. Seeley muses on this tension and locates the 1920s as the onset of the disease that would ul-

timately kill the company, when Rupert D'Oyly Carte made a series of decisions that resulted in a form of stylistic paralysis. The company's recordings, starting at about this time, could only contribute to ossification, intensified by a bad habit of hiring from within.

Seeley worked for the D'Oyly Carte Opera Company in its last years and saw vestiges of Carte's idiosyncratic administrative system still intact a century later (p. 89). He proposed a biography of Carte as early as 1978, but was discouraged by Bridget D'Oyly Carte (Carte's granddaughter) because 'it has always been found that there was no material available to make possible the writing of such a biography of a sufficiently serious, factual and interesting kind, and the idea has had to be abandoned' (quoted on p. xi). We can be thankful that Seeley did not abandon it, even if it took decades to complete the book. With the biographical details now more thoroughly examined, what Carte deserves now is a multidisciplinary symposium with published proceedings to follow. He was an important figure, and his accomplishments are too wide-reaching to be explicated properly within a single discipline.

JAMES BROOKS KUYKENDALL

*University of Mary Washington*

doi:10.1093/ml/gcaa066

© The Author(s) (2020). Published by Oxford University Press. All rights reserved.

*Jews and Music-Making in the Polish Lands*. Ed. by François Guesnet, Benjamin Matis, and Antony Polonsky. Pp. xv + 552. Polin: Studies in Polish Jewry, 32. (The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, London, 2020. ISBN 978-906764-74-6 (hard cover), £55; -73-9 (paperback), £24.95.)

The essays in *Jews and Music-Making in the Polish Lands* offer rich examinations of a vast and under-studied scholarly terrain. They treat popular, religious, and classical music from roughly the mid-eighteenth century to the present, focusing on the region of eastern Europe that once had one of the world's largest Jewish populations. The book is the latest volume of *Polin: Studies in Polish Jewry*, a series that since 1986 has been a main forum for scholars of Polish–Jewish history. It is especially welcome that *Polin's* editors have turned their attention to music: although Polish Jews were deeply involved with musical life in eastern Europe, scholars of Polish–Jewish culture have more often been drawn to literature or theatre than to music. The core contribution of *Jews and*

*Music-Making* is to reveal the diversity and complexity of Jewish musical culture in the region, while eschewing essentialist narratives about Jewish identity or Polish–Jewish antagonisms. In this sense, the volume succeeds in bringing music into the broader domain of Polish–Jewish studies, a field that has long highlighted the nuances and debates that permeated Jewish experience. However, as I will suggest in conclusion, the essays also show that there is still work to be done from a specifically musical and sonic perspective.

Polish–Jewish music has often fallen through the cracks of prior scholarship. Anglo-American scholars face the substantial language barrier of learning Polish to access the relevant archival materials, many of which remain undigitized in Poland and are difficult to locate without the ability to speak fluently with archivists. At the same time, scholars with the language skills and archival access have at times been reluctant to thematize Jewish topics directly. In the realm of classical music, for example, deeply sourced monographs on acculturated Jewish composers (or those of Jewish background) including Tadeusz Zygfryd Kassern, Roman Palester, or Józef Koffler have focused more on the reconstruction of biography and musical legacy than the composers' identities (Violetta Kostka, *Tadeusz Zygfryd Kassern: Indywidualne odmiany stylów muzycznych XX wieku* (Poznań, 2011); Zofia Helman, *Roman Palester: Twórca i dzieło* (Kraków, 1999); Maciej Gołąb, *Józef Koffler: Compositional Style and Source Documents* (Los Angeles, 2004)). Works explicitly about Jewish musicians, by comparison, have often taken the form of who's-who dictionaries, which have little space to explore broader themes (most recently, Leon Tadeusz Błaszczyk, *Żydzi w kulturze muzycznej ziem polskich w XIX i XX wieku: Słownik biograficzny* (Warsaw, 2014)). *Jews and Music-Making in the Polish Lands* helps to remedy these long-standing issues.

Musicologists should know that the volume assumes readers will have considerable familiarity with Polish history. For example, some readers might be confused by the volume's geographic purview: 'Polish Lands' of the title refers to 'the Polish–Lithuanian Commonwealth and its successor state' (p. 4), yet most of the essays treat the period after the Polish–Lithuanian Commonwealth's demise in 1795 and thus the 'successor states'. Why, a reader might wonder, do the editors define a geographic scope on the basis of an Early Modern state that had collapsed before most of the musicians in the essays were even born? Within Polish–Jewish studies, however, this geographic purview is relatively common, since the Polish–Lithuanian Common-

wealth covered a vast swathe of eastern Europe and at one time had the world's largest Jewish community. After the Commonwealth's demise, Poles and Jews continued to live in the successor states and identified to varying degrees with their new rulers as well as with Polish language and culture. Thus, the seeming geographic vagueness of 'Polish Lands' in fact captures the wide range of Jewish experiences that played out within a Polish cultural sphere, without reifying the national borders that were frequently redrawn during the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. (As an aside, this trans-border scope of the volume means that several essays will interest scholars of ethnic minorities in Imperial Russia, the Austrian Empire, and the Soviet Union.)

Although a full discussion of each of the twenty-six contributions is beyond the scope of this review, some major themes emerge from the volume. The first section, 'Cantorial and Religious Music', focuses on the increasing professionalization, travels, and commercial draw of cantors from the late eighteenth century until the Second World War. Bożena Muszkalska's essay, 'The Art of Cantorial Singing in the Polish Territories', provides an overview of the development of cantorial performance and explores the world of the touring cantors who made their living as both composers and interpreters of sacred music. Daniel S. Katz and Akiva Zimmermann provide fascinating studies of the competition for cantors among synagogues and of how the reception of their performances became a major forum of Jewish public life during this period.

The next section, 'Jews in Popular Musical Culture in Poland', is both the longest and the widest in subject matter. It includes treatments of folk songs by Michael Lukin, Yiddish theatre by Amanda (Miryam-Khaye) Seigel and Michael Aylward, Polish-language popular song by Robert A. Rothstein, and film by Tamara Sztyma and Ronald Robboy. Bret Werb opens the section with a cogently argued examination of the musical genre of the *majufes*, when Jews during the early nineteenth century were summoned by Polish gentry to give humiliating, travesty performances of the *Mah yafit* sabbath song for the entertainment of the aristocrats. Werb's deeply sourced musical examples of the *majufes* shed light on the sounds of anti-Jewish stereotypes and the durability of the genre into the twentieth century.

Another highlight of the popular music section is Beth Holmgren's study of Jewish cabaret artists and musicians in the Anders Army. This army, which was created in the Soviet Union in 1941 of Polish citizens who had been deported to

the USSR during the Second World War, helped many refugees escape the USSR. Although the Anders Army was notorious for refusing admittance to Polish–Jewish refugees, Holmgren shows how its leadership readily embraced urbane Polish–Jewish musicians and writers who provided much-needed entertainment during the Army’s journeys across the USSR and the Middle East. Turning to the post-war period, Filip Mazurczak’s article on Władysław Szpilman’s post-war career will be of special interest to many readers. Szpilman is famous for his harrowing tale of Holocaust survival as dramatized in Roman Polański’s Oscar-winning film *The Pianist* (2002), but his later life was almost as fascinating. As Mazurczak documents, Szpilman served as head of Polish Radio (and later its popular music section), composed hundreds of popular and ‘mass’ songs, played chamber music with the Warsaw Quintet, and founded an international song festival in Sopot on the Baltic coast. (On Szpilman’s extended family, see Joel E. Rubin’s chapter on the Szpilman, Bajgelman, and Barsht families of klezmer musicians in the same section.)

The third section, ‘Jews in the Polish Classical Music Scene’, opens with James Loeffler’s examination of the national and capitalist dynamics among early Jewish gramophone proponents. Many of the other essays in this section provide important new details about little-known figures and institutions: Paula Eisenstein-Baker writes on Leon Zeitlin, Julia Riegel on Menachem Kipnis, Sylwia Jakubczyk-Ślęczka on Jewish musical organizations in the province of Galicia, and Sławomir Dobrzański on the exiled composer Tadeusz Zygfryd Kassern. A perspective that will be of special interest to musicologists because of its engagement with themes of internationalism and cosmopolitanism during the inter-war years is Adam J. Sacks’s essay on the Jewish music students of east European origins at the Berlin Conservatory, which he convincingly describes as a site of ‘mobility . . . and the transcendence of origins’ (p. 321). Maja Trochimczyk’s essay on ‘Jewish Composers of Polish Music after 1939’ provides a useful tally of composers who were exiled or murdered during the Holocaust.

It is impossible to write about modern Polish–Jewish history without confronting the Holocaust. Although every essay in the volume resists the temptation to read the Holocaust and post-Holocaust memory onto earlier periods, the destruction of Polish Jewry nonetheless appears as an end point or background to many essays. The Holocaust experience is treated more explicitly in the fourth section of the volume, ‘The Holo-

caust Reflected in Jewish Music’. Joseph D. Toltz examines songs from the Łódź ghetto, as conveyed through later interviews with survivors. By comparison, Eliyana R. Adler turns our attention to a relatively neglected Holocaust-era song repertory: that of Polish Jews who had survived the Holocaust because they had been deported to the USSR in the first years of the Second World War. In one of the few essays in the volume to examine the material history of music-making, Carla Shapreau examines the fate of Wanda Landowska’s music collections after their plunder by the Nazis. Bella Szwarcman-Czarnota’s concluding chapter, although framed in terms of Holocaust memory, is equally insightful for the sources she unearths concerning the Jewish Musical Institute in pre-war Vilna.

The final section explores the revival of interest in Jewish music and especially klezmer in post-1989 Poland. The decimation of Polish Jews during the Holocaust left only a pale shadow of the culture’s pre-war vibrancy. Nonetheless, in recent years there has been both great interest and considerable controversy about the revival of Jewish musical performances in Poland. Embracing the complexity of this scene, Magdalena Waligórska interprets klezmer as a ‘contact zone’, a place that not only allows Jews and non-Jews to interact, but also ‘come to grips with each other’ (p. 467). Eleanor Shapiro explores similar themes, but she directs focus away from large urban centres, where scholars of the Jewish revival have often focused, to instead study small towns such as Chmielnik or Lelów.

If we take these essays as a barometer of the current state of Polish–Jewish music studies, then what avenues of scholarly inquiry remain in need of further attention? Unsurprisingly, the essays confirm that much interest to date has focused on the late nineteenth century and first half of the twentieth century, a period commonly seen as a flourishing of Jewish culture. More is still to be said about the experiences of Polish–Jewish musicians after the Holocaust—whether about composers like Aleksander Tansman and Karol Rathaus or jazz-band leaders like Albert Harris. The revival of interest in Jewish music in post-war Poland is another major area for further inquiry, Waligórska’s and Shapiro’s excellent contributions aside. How, for example, was Józef Koffler’s music ‘re-discovered’ after the war and why did Polish composers with little or no prior interest in Jewish topics, such as Stanisław Wiechowicz, begin engaging with Holocaust memory in the 1960s?

Perhaps the greatest opportunity for future research is to renew focus on the sounds of Jewish music-making and to connect these

sounds to the transnational contexts in which they were created. Most (although not all) of the essays focus on textual analysis of lyrics, rely on generalizations about a composer's style without providing examples, or focus on the institutions of music-making at the expense of the music these institutions promoted. While there is, of course, nothing inherently misguided about studying the texts or context of music, this focus does raise the question as to whether musical sound (or musical performance) in fact mattered to how Polish-Jewish music was received. Addressing this question would help bring Polish-Jewish musical cultures into a wider comparative perspective with music-making elsewhere around the globe, since many of the musical styles discussed in the volume—whether popular songs or neoclassical compositions—grew out of the international circulation of musical styles. Future scholarship that embraces both the particularity of the Polish-Jewish context and the broad resonance of its themes will best advance the admirable work of this volume's editors and contributors.

J. MACKENZIE PIERCE

*University of Michigan, Ann Arbor*

doi:10.1093/ml/gcaa067

© The Author(s) (2020). Published by Oxford University Press. All rights reserved.

*Making Music American: 1917 and the Transformation of Culture.* By E. Douglas Bomberger. Pp. 288. (Oxford University Press, New York and Oxford, 2018. ISBN 978-0-19-087231-1 (hard cover), £19.99.)

E. Douglas Bomberger's *Making Music American* is a highly engaging and deftly researched account of American musical activities in the year 1917. This specific year is worthy of book-length treatment, he argues, because two pivotal events—the release of the first jazz record and the US government's declaration of war—left indelible marks on American musical culture. Echoing the narrative structure of Hugh MacDonald's *Music in 1853: The Biography of a Year* (Boydell, 2012), Bomberger's volume follows the lives of eight protagonists by presenting colourful monthly snapshots of their experiences, both public and private. His relatively diverse cross-section includes the conductors Karl Muck, James Reese Europe, and Walter Damrosch; the jazz cornetists Freddie Keppard and Nick LaRocca; the pianist Olga Samaroff; the violinist Fritz Kreisler; and the contralto Ernestine Schumann-Heink. With the eye of a seasoned biographer, Bomberger skilfully captures each

figure's personality as well as the psychological impact of the year's events, especially the mobilization for war. Overall, the book makes an essential contribution to American musical historiography.

Bomberger's central argument is that both the US entry into war and the volcanic rise of jazz in the public sphere upset old political and cultural orders that would never return. As he presents it, the old musical order comprised the predominantly German-speaking classical music industry, whose key figures like Damrosch and Schumann-Heink were extraordinarily popular. On the level of praxis, musicians of the old order, all of whom were highly literate in the Western tradition, sought to reproduce pre-existing musical works in a manner that faithfully conveyed the composer's intentions. The new order of jazz, in contrast, comprised American-born musicians, often of African ancestry, who may or may not have been trained to read music and relished improvisation—composing in the moment of performance. Further, once jazz was released on record, musicians began to use these physical objects (rather than scores) as points of departure for their own compositional experiments. Ultimately, Bomberger treats the freewheeling and instantly popular practice of jazz as a sonic metaphor of American intervention into European political affairs: a country built on democratic principles attacking the German Empire, ostensibly one of the last vestiges of oppressive, tyrannical governance in the West. Like the explosive growth of the marketplace for recorded jazz and other popular genres after 1917, the eventual Allied victory signalled the demise of a centuries-old political order.

Enhancing this metaphorical treatment, Bomberger emphasizes race relations throughout the book since race played a central role in shaping both the music industry and the contours of war. Although African-American groups like Freddie Keppard's Original Creole Orchestra introduced the country to jazz in public performance, Nick LaRocca's all-White Original Dixieland Jazz Band received the lion's share of credit (and money) for popularizing the genre after earning a prime spot as a regular act at a New York club and eventually releasing the first jazz record. This inequitable relationship portended the commercial music industry's well-documented exploitation of Black musicians, especially as White performers profited enormously by copyrighting or covering music originally created by African Americans.

Likewise, racial discrimination within the military, coupled with the government's inability